

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: June 15, 2017

Location: Homeland Security Conference Room, 8th floor, 1300 Perdido Street, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 1:00 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Calvin Alexander

Commissioners absent: Andrew P. Sanchez, Tony French, Jennifer Greene

I. Minutes of the May 11, 2017 meeting.

Motion: Approve the Minutes.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, H.V. Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments

At this time Calvin Alexander arrived at the meeting.

II. Designation of 2515 N Robertson as a landmark.

Speakers: Erin Holmes spoke in support of the designation.

Bob Ellis spoke in opposition to the designation.

Motion: Designate the property.

By: Rosalind Peychaud

Second: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Consent Agenda

Speakers: Virginia Plute & Emmy bridges spoke against the application for 625 Esplanade.

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, H.V.

Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

- Withdrawn**
- A. 2257 Bayou Rd: Donald Maginnis, applicant; James G Derbes, owner; Modification to conceptually approved proposal to construct new 950 SF detached accessory building.
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=16-38459-HDLC>
 - B. 625 Esplanade Ave: Esplanade Ridge Historic District, Full Control: Charles Oliver, applicant; Chandelier Development Nola LLC, owner; Construct three-and half-story, two family residential building.
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-16964-HDLC>
 - C. 3309 Marais St: Bywater Historic District, Full Control: Nathan Garnache, applicant; Burk Property Investments LLC, owner; Demolish existing rear addition and construct new camelback addition.
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-16968-HDLC>
 - D. 636 Lizardi St: Holy Cross, Full Control: L. Jeff Williams, applicant; New Orleans Redevelopment Authority, owner; New construction a 1,800 sf. single family residence
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-17030-HDLC>
 - E. 827 Verret St: Algiers Point, Full Control: Seth Welty, applicant; New Orleans Redevelopment Authority, owner; Construct new two-story, single-family residential building.
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-17188-HDLC>
 - F. 831 Verret St: Algiers Point, Full Control: Seth Welty, applicant; New Orleans Redevelopment Authority, owner; Construct new two-story, single-family residential building.
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-17222-HDLC>
 - G. 930 Louisa St: Bywater Historic District, Full Control: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Frankenheimer Credit Shelter Trust, owner; Structural renovation of existing single-family residence and existing accessory structure, including new dormers and balcony.
<http://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-17283-HDLC>

IV. New Business Work Applications

A. 2600 Gravier St.

Application: Elizabeth Smyth, applicant; Falstaff Associates I, LLC, Falstaff Associates I, LLC, owner; Paint previously unpainted masonry wall on Landmark building.

Motion: Approve the application to paint the previously-unpainted masonry wall, provided the staff approves the final products.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Westley Bayas

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 502 Olivier St.

Application: Melanie Tennyson, applicant; Holy Name of Mary Roman Catholic Church, owner; Request to allow temporary school buildings to remain in place for an additional period of time.

Motion: Approve the request to allow the temporary modular school buildings to remain in place for an additional two years, in order to allow time for the applicant to meet with the property owner and discuss permanent solutions. The Commission can reassess the situation in two years based on the outcome of those discussions.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Comments:

C. 3305 Marais St.

Application: Nathan Garnache, applicant; Burk Property Investments LLC, owner; Appeal of ARC no action vote on application to construct new two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Jeanne Nathan

Second: Rosalind Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, John Deveney, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 1017-19 Desire St.

Application: Harold Domingue, applicant; Elizabeth T Pearce, owner; Replace existing slate roof with standing seam metal or asphalt shingle roof.

Motion: Approve the application to remove the existing slate roof and install a new architectural-grade asphalt shingle roof, provided that the existing ridge tiles and historic roof vents are retained.

By: John Deveney

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 542 Jackson Ave.

Application: Brian Mackel, applicant; Andre L Savoie, owner; Remove existing metal roof and chimney, install new asphalt shingle roof.

Motion: Approve the application to remove the existing metal roof, and to install a new asphalt shingle roof. The Commission agreed the removal of the chimney was inappropriate and denied the application for removal of the existing brick chimney. The brick chimney should be repaired to match existing.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, John Deveney, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time John Deveney left the meeting.

VI. New Business Demolition Application

A. 4534 Banks St.

Application: L. Jeff Williams, applicant; Booker Enterprises LLC, owner; Demolition of existing structure
Speakers: Erin Holmes, Betsy Stout, and Karen Ocker spoke against the demolition. Aaron Pure spoke in support of the demolition.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blalanc, Ed deMontluzin, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, Westley Bayas, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed: Jeanne Nathan

Comments:

B. 1250 N Claiborne Ave.

Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

C. 3919 Marais St.

Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

D. 717 Teche St.

Application: Jerry Moore DBA J L Moore Construction, applicant; David B Kaufman, owner; Demolition of remaining front portion of one-story residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to allow the applicant time to submit redevelopment plans for ARC review.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Ed deMontluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Rosalind Peychaud, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Westley Bayas, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time Rosalind Peychaud and Westley Bayas left the meeting.

E. 1817 Hollygrove St.

Application: Roshan Desai, applicant; Ctn Holdings, LLC, owner; Demolish existing one-story single-family residential building

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission hearing so that the applicant may meet with an HDLC Inspector for a supplemental inspection to assess the conditions of elements that are not visible from the public right of way.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Ed deMontluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 625 Esplanade Ave.

Comments: Item was withdrawn.

G. 210 State Building 4

Application: Amanda Rivera, applicant; Children's Hospital, Dept of Transportation & Development, owner; Demolition of an ancillary metal addition to an existing masonry building.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition of the ancillary metal addition.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 525 Arabella St.

Speakers: Betsy Stout and Tobb Tebesco spoke in support of the demolition.

Application: Terry Tedesco, applicant; Wilfred P Hotard, owner; Demolish existing one-story, single-family residential building

Motion: Approve the application for demolition.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Calvin Alexander, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, H.V. Nagendra, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

I. 2916 Cadiz St.

Application: Laquon Nunnery, applicant/owner; Demolition of existing single-story, two-family residential building.

Speakers: Erin Holmes spoke against the demolition.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition. After reviewing the photos and HDLC Inspector's report, the Commission agreed the building is an integral and contributing element to the existing streetscape and the existing conditions of the structure did not warrant demolition.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

J. 3117 Pine St.

Application: Clarence Albert Harrell, applicant; 7612Forum LLC, owner; Demolition of existing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition. The Commission agreed that the current proposal illustrates a constructive demolition of the structure. They requested the plans be modified to show more of the existing bargeboard structure being retained with the understanding that additional framing may be required to do so.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan, Renee Lapeyrolerie

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. New Business Retention Application

A. 931 Euterpe St.

Comments: This item was deferred until after 819 Gallier St.

B. 418 Olivier St.

Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

C. 618 Harmony St.

Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

At this time Anne Redd left the meeting.

D. 819 Gallier St.

Application: Chelsea J Gaudet, owner; Retention of inappropriate brown roof shingles, batten shutters, and removal of ridge tiles.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the brown roof shingles. Deny the application for the retention of the board-and-batten shutters and the removal of the ridge tiles.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Second: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan, Renee Lapeyrolerie

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 931 Euterpe St.

Application: Wayne Jeffery Erdman, applicant; Charles R Mann, owner; Retention of highly visible silver framed solar panels installed without a CofA.

Motion: Approve the application for the retention of silver framed solar panels on a standing seam metal roof.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 4006-08 Royal St.

Application: Bart Theriot, applicant/owner; Retention of and additional modifications to inappropriate gates installed across front porch steps.

Motion to deny retention

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second:

Result: Motion died for lack of a second.

Motion: Motion to approve retention.

By: Jeanne Nathan

Second:

Result: Motion died for lack of a second.

Comments: There were no further motions. Due to inaction, the application for retention of any gate across the front porch steps and, and the request to install a larger gate at the location of the existing gate were denied.

VIII. Remaining Deferred Items

A. 1250 N Claiborne Ave.

Application: M & M Enterprises Group, L.L.C, applicant; Claiborne/Esplanade, LLC, owner; Demolition of one-story commercial building to be a vacant lot.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition until redevelopment plans have been submitted and conceptually approved by the Architectural Review Committee.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 3919 Marais St.

Application: Mark Morice, applicant; Treyark Properties LLC, owner; Demolition of one-story residential building.

Speaker: Charles Clark spoke in support of the demolition.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant may attend the meeting.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Ed deMontluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 418 Olivier St.

Application: Stephen J Ellis, applicant/owner; Retention of inappropriate railings installed at side deck.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant may attend the meeting.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 618 Harmony St.

Application: T M F Hotel Properties LLC, applicant/owner; Retention of multiple deviations from approved plans for the new construction of a two story, residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant may attend the meeting.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Second: H.V. Nagendra

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jesse Le Blanc, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, H.V. Nagendra, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

IX. HDLC Reports and Communications